

ppi 201502ZU4645

Esta publicación científica en formato digital es continuidad de la revista impresa  
ISSN-Versión Impresa 0798-1406 / ISSN-Versión on line 2542-3185 Depósito legal pp  
197402ZU34



# CUESTIONES POLÍTICAS

Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Derecho Público "Dr. Humberto J. La Roche"  
de la Facultad de Ciencias Jurídicas y Políticas de la Universidad del Zulia  
Maracaibo, Venezuela



Vol.41

Nº 78

Julio

Septiembre

2023



# CUESTIONES POLÍTICAS

Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Derecho Público "Dr. Humberto J. La Roche"  
de la Facultad de Ciencias Jurídicas y Políticas de la Universidad del Zulia  
Maracaibo, Venezuela



**Vol.41**

**N° 78**

**Julio**

**Septiembre**

**2023**



# Cuestiones Políticas

La revista **Cuestiones Políticas**, es una publicación auspiciada por el Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Derecho Público “Dr. Humberto J. La Roche” (IEPDP) de la Facultad de Ciencias Jurídicas y Políticas de la Universidad del Zulia.

Entre sus objetivos figuran: contribuir con el progreso científico de las Ciencias Humanas y Sociales, a través de la divulgación de los resultados logrados por sus investigadores; estimular la investigación en estas áreas del saber; y propiciar la presentación, discusión y confrontación de las ideas y avances científicos con compromiso social.

**Cuestiones Políticas** aparece dos veces al año y publica trabajos originales con avances o resultados de investigación en las áreas de Ciencia Política y Derecho Público, los cuales son sometidos a la consideración de árbitros calificados.

---

ESTA PUBLICACIÓN APARECE RESEÑADA, ENTRE OTROS ÍNDICES, EN:

ReviychLUZ, International Political Science Abstracts, Revista Interamericana de Bibliografía, Centro Latinoamericano para el Desarrollo (CLAD), Bibliografía Socio Económica de Venezuela de REDINSE, International Bibliography of Political Science, Revencyt, Hispanic American Periodicals (Index/HAPI), Ulrich's Periodicals Directory, EBSCO; y se encuentra acreditada en el Registro de Publicaciones Científicas y Tecnológicas Venezolanas del FONACIT y Latindex.

---

## Comité Editorial

Jorge Jesús Villasmil Espinoza (Editor)	Universidad del Zulia, Venezuela
Mario Hugo Ayala	Universidad de Buenos Aires, Argentina
Figol Nadiya Mykolayivna	National Technical university of Ukraine, Ucrania
Beata Trojanowska	Kazimierz Wielki University, Polonia
Eurico Wongo Gunhula	Universidade Óscar Ribas (UÓR), Angola
Magda Julissa Rojas Bahamón	Professor IE Jorge Eliécer Gaitán
Iuliia Pinkovetskaia	Universidad Estatal de Ulyanovsk, Rusia
Jorge Fymark Vidovic Lopez	Ediciones Clío, España
Lino Latella Calderón	Universidad del Zulia, Venezuela
Mariby Boscán	Universidad del Zulia, Venezuela
Olga I. Vaganova	State Pedagogical University, Rusia
Diego Felipe Arbeláez Campillo	Universidad de la Amazonia, Colombia
Miguel Armando López Leyva	Director Instituto Investigaciones Sociales UNAM, Mexico
Roman Oleksenko	Universidad Estatal de Agrotecnología Dmytro Motornyi Tavria, Melitopol, Ucrania

## Traductor

William Joel Manjarrés Torres

## Maquetadora

Dayric Portillo

**Revista Cuestiones Políticas.** Av. Guajira. Universidad del Zulia. Núcleo Humanístico. Facultad de Ciencias Jurídicas y Políticas. Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Derecho Público  
“Dr. Humberto J. La Roche”. Maracaibo, Venezuela.  
E-mail: cuestionespolicas@gmail.com. Telefax: 58-0261-4127018.

**Autoridades Rectorales**  
**Universidad del Zulia**



**Dra. Judith Aular de Durán**  
**Rectora de la Universidad del Zulia**

**Dr. Clotilde Navarro Urbaneja**  
**Vice-Rector Académico Encargado**

**Dra. Marlene Primera Galue**  
**Vice-Rectora Administrativa Encargada**

**Dra. Ixora Gómez Salazar**  
**Secretaria Encargada**

---

**Consejo de Desarrollo Científico, Humanístico  
y Tecnológico (CONDES-CDCHT)**

Gilberto Vizcaíno  
*Coordinador - Secretario*



**Facultad de Ciencias Jurídicas y Políticas**

Diana Romero La Roche  
*Decana*

---

**Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Derecho Público**  
**“Dr. Humberto J. La Roche”**



Dra. Loiralith Chirinos  
*Directora (e)*

Maria Eugenia Soto Hernández  
*Secretaria Coordinadora*

Jorge Jesús Villasmil Espinoza  
*Jefe de la Sección de Publicaciones*

Henry Alberto Vaivads Fuenmayor  
*Jefe de la Sección de Ciencia Política*

Loiralith Margarita Chirinos Portillo  
*Jefe de la Sección de Derecho Público*



## Contenido

- 16 **Presentación**
- Derecho Público**
- 27 **Legal Aspects of Ensuring Food Security in Modern Conditions of Development**  
Aspectos legales para garantizar la seguridad alimentaria en las condiciones modernas de desarrollo  
*Andrii Kulaiets, Mariia Kulayets, Lidiia Shynkaruk, Daria Kendus y Mykyta Gerashchenko*
- 38 **State legal regulation of the hotel and restaurant complex in the system of development of the national economy**  
Regulación jurídica estatal del complejo hotelero y restaurantero en el sistema de desarrollo de la economía nacional  
*Oksana Poltavska, Iryna Lashchuk, Tetiana Nikitchina, Natalia Smolinska y Yuliia Borutska*
- 50 **Legal aspects of the formation, development and use of human capital in financial activities**  
Aspectos legales de la formación, desarrollo y utilización del capital humano en las actividades financieras  
*Oksana Nahirna, Olha Viunyk, Inna Vysotska, Liubomyr Vankovych y Nataliia Chapliak*
- 63 **Transformation of international forms of legal regulation of corporate relationships**  
Transformación de las formas internacionales de regulación jurídica de las relaciones corporativas  
*Volodymyr Gevko, Oksana Brusakova, Oleg Posykaliuk, Vasyl Hrudnytskyi y Stanislav Sieriebriak*
- 77 **Taxation of Charitable Giving in Terms of Martial Law in Ukraine: Legislative Novelties and Future Models**  
Tributación de donaciones caritativas en términos de derecho marcial en Ucrania: Novedades legislativas y modelos futuros  
*Volodymyr Korol, Oksana Nebyltsova, Yurii Burylo, Vladyslav Teremetskyi y Igor Pryianchuk*
- 94 **Modalities of protection of the rights of individuals according to the administrative-procedural order and in legal-administrative procedures**  
Modalidades de protección de los derechos de las personas según el ordenamiento administrativo-procesal y en los procedimientos jurídico-administrativos  
*Volodymyr Horbalynskiy, Olena Markova, Yuliia Volkova, Vlada Litoshko y Kateryna Hlukhoveria*



- 104** | **Legal dimensions of innovative development management functions**  
Dimensiones jurídicas de las funciones innovadoras de gestión del desarrollo  
*Galyna Liakhovych, Viktoriya Ivanyuta, Ganna Mokhonko, Oksana Vakun y Ulyana Lyakhovych*
- 116** | **Estructura de la conciencia jurídica en el sistema de Derechos Humanos: Aspecto civilizador y psicológico del desarrollo de la sociedad**  
Estructura de la conciencia jurídica en el sistema de Derechos Humanos: Aspecto civilizador y psicológico del desarrollo de la sociedad  
*Oleksandr Skrypniuk, Yaroslav Zhovnirchuk, Valentina Shamrayeva, Natalia Tsumariyeva y Ivan Bandura*
- 128** | **The air transport industry as an object and subject of government regulation**  
La industria del transporte aéreo como objeto y sujeto de regulación estatal  
*Mykhaylo Klymchuk, Oleksandr Bernaziuk, Maryna Kovalyova, Petro Kravchuk y Oleksii Humin*
- 143** | **War crimes and crimes against humanity in Ukraine: Legal qualification and features of documentation**  
Crímenes de guerra y crímenes contra la humanidad en Ucrania: Calificación legal y características de la documentación  
*Nina Rogatinska, Oleksandr Halahan, Oleh Protsiuk, Sergii Galagan y Natalia Fierieva*
- 166** | **Legal regulation of the automation of judicial enforcement proceedings: International experience**  
Regulación legal de la automatización de los procedimientos judiciales de ejecución: Experiencia internacional  
*Nataliia Sergiienko, Serhii Suslin, Viktor Makarenko, Vira Pyrohovska y Maxim Tymoshenko*
- 178** | **Theory and practice of influence caused by the criminal subculture on crime in the penitentiary sphere**  
Teoría y práctica de la influencia que provoca la subcultura delictiva sobre la delincuencia en el ámbito penitenciario  
*Dmytro Kolodchyn, Oleksandr Mykhalik, Olha Bohatyrova, Valentina Merkulova y Olesia Laptinova*
- 188** | **Procesos de secularización de símbolos religiosos en el discurso político contemporáneo: Aproximaciones desde la antropología política**  
Processes of secularization of religious symbols in contemporary political discourse: Approaches from political anthropology  
*Yurii Kozar, Yurii Ostapets, Oleg Kaskiv, Vasyl Gogol, Vitaliy Derkach y Lesia Levchenko*



- 203** | **Prospects for improving public control over the observance of the rights of convicts**  
Perspectivas para mejorar el control público sobre la observancia de los derechos de los convictos  
*Pavlo Harasym, Roma Sybirna, Volodymyr Ortynskyi, Roman Shai y Mariia Maskovita*
- 218** | **Personal security and sustainable development at work**  
Seguridad del individuo y desarrollo estable en el campo laboral  
*Bohdan Tsymbal, Yuriy Dreval, Artem Petryshchev y Andrey Andreev*
- 232** | **Lineamientos teóricos para el desarrollo de una política de promoción del ecoturismo**  
Theoretical guidelines for the development of an ecotourism promotion policy  
*Volodymyr Vorovka, Oksana Marchenko, Anatolii Postol, Maryna Salnikova y Ulyana Khanas*
- 246** | **Rethinking destructive rumors as a legal means of solving the problems of intercultural interactions**  
Repensar los rumores destructivos como medio legal de resolver los problemas de las interacciones interculturales  
*Lyudmila Afanasieva, Natalia Hlebova, Iryna Bukrieieva, Lyudmila Glyns'ka y Ihor Chychanovsky*
- 259** | **Policy issues and legal support for the activity of the State Bureau of Investigation in Ukraine**  
Cuestiones de política y apoyo jurídico a la actividad de la Oficina Estatal de Investigación en Ucrania  
*Olena Gulak, Viktoriia Halai, Pozniakov Spartak, Pavlo Parkhomenko y Maryan Hurkovskyj*
- 272** | **Políticas deportivas en el mundo actual**  
Sports policies in today's world  
*Vlada Bilohur, Nataliia Nesterenko, Eduard Syvokhop, Andriy Protsenko, Viktoriia Tsybulska y Yaroslav Stupnyk*
- 284** | **Civilizational and culturological aspect of philosophical and legal studies of observance of human rights**  
Aspecto civilizatorio y cultural de las investigaciones filosóficas y jurídicas sobre la observancia de los derechos humanos  
*Nataliia Gaivoroniuk, Hanna Siromska, Viacheslav Serhieiev, Viktoriia Zahurska-Antoniuk, Andrii Kobetiak y Violeta Tohobytska*
- 296** | **Transformation of the State policy of Ukraine in the healthcare sector during martial law**  
Transformación de la política de Estado de Ucrania en el sector de la salud durante la ley marcial  
*Olesia Batryn, Iryna Chekhovska, Natalia Uvarova, Tatiana Zhehlinska y Alona Komziuk*



- 309** | **Legal regulation of occupational safety and health**  
Regulación jurídica de la seguridad y salud en el trabajo  
*Zoriana Kozak, Lesia Shapoval y Pavlo Cherevko*
- 326** | **Identification of new threats to the national security of the state**  
Identificación de nuevas amenazas a la seguridad nacional del Estado  
*Ivo Svoboda, Mykhailo Shevchuk, Oleksandr Shamsutdinov, Pavlo Lysianskyi y Oleksii Voluiko*
- 345** | **Objective assessment in the quality assurance system of the academic virtue of the university in the context of legal security**  
Evaluación objetiva en el sistema de aseguramiento de la calidad de la virtud académica de la universidad en el contexto de la seguridad jurídica  
*Anna Helesh, Nataliya Mukan, Oleh Davydchak, Ivanna Huzii y Nataliia Dolinska*
- 357** | **The impact of Russian military aggression on the establishment of a new Ukrainian political nation**  
El impacto de la agresión militar rusa en el establecimiento de una nueva nación política ucraniana  
*Mykola Stadnyk, Vasyl Chernets, Olga Marukhovska-Kartunova, Svitlana Kolybabiuk y Stepan Svorak*
- 374** | **Correlation of the principles of criminal law in the conditions of the introduction of martial law**  
Correlación de los principios del derecho penal en las condiciones de la introducción de la ley marcial  
*Ihor Hrytsiuk, Anatolii Talakh, Volodymyr Zavydniak, Valentyn Liudvik y Anastasiia Filipp*
- 384** | **Armed violence in the system of state image formation**  
La violencia armada en el sistema de formación de la imagen del Estado  
*Volodymyr Zablotskyi, Liudmyla Novoskoltseva, Olena Mezhenka, Fedir Khodko y Stephanie Brynchak*
- 400** | **Mechanisms of strengthening the economic sovereignty of the state in the context of military operations**  
Mecanismos de fortalecimiento de la soberanía económica del Estado en el contexto de operaciones militares  
*Yevhen Bilousov, Ivan Yakoviyk, Kateryna Yefremova, Eugene Novikov y Ihor Zhukov*
- 417** | **Use of criminal analysis in operational and search activities**  
Uso del análisis criminal en actividades operativas y de búsqueda  
*Ihor Vitaliiovych Nazarenko, Andrii Mykolaiovych Khankevych, Adam Lavrentiiovych Dal, Yevhenii Rybynskyi y Viacheslav Hordienko*





- 428 **The budgetary mechanism of the national economic development model: Political aspects**  
El mecanismo presupuestario del modelo nacional de desarrollo económico: Aspectos políticos  
*Nadiia Kulchytska y Volodymyr Lysyuk*
- 440 **European Union migration policy: Current problems and prospects for analysis**  
Política migratoria de la Unión Europea: Problemas actuales y perspectivas de análisis  
*Kateryna Bannikova, Olena Sviatun, Maryna Shevchenko, Nataliia Bielousova y Volodymyr Saienko*
- 456 **Cross-Border Mediation under Current Threats: Ukraine-Poland (Some Aspects of Interaction)**  
Mediación transfronteriza bajo las amenazas actuales: Ucrania-Polonia (Algunos aspectos de la interacción)  
*Ewelina Kosciukiewicz-Swierczewska, Vadym Hrachuk, Serhii Knysh, Yuliia Fidria y Iryna Novosad*
- 470 **La exhumación de cadáveres como aporte a procesos ministeriales y judiciales en el Cementerio Municipal de la ciudad de Riobamba**  
Exhumation of corpses as a contribution to ministerial and judicial processes in the Municipal Cemetery of the city of Riobamba  
*Selena Marisol Quispe Monar, Jorge Marcelo Quintana Yáñez y Alex Fabián Inca Falconi*
- 493 **Formation of a security environment for personnel management of socio-economic systems before and during the war: Legal aspect**  
Formación de un entorno de seguridad para la gestión del personal de los sistemas socioeconómicos antes y durante la guerra: Aspecto legal  
*Stepan Melnyk, Odarka Chabaniuk, Zoryana Ravlinko, Nina Petrukha y Iryna Bodnariuk*
- 504 **Non-state social security: International legal comparative experience**  
Seguridad social no estatal: Experiencia jurídica internacional comparada  
*Yegor Krasnov, Vyacheslav Truba, Anna Hudz, Olha Potopakhina y Andrii Skorobagatko*
- 523 **Corporate liability and white-collar crime: Comparative review**  
Responsabilidad de las empresas y delitos de cuello blanco: Revisión comparativa  
*Anatoliï Tarasiuk, Daria Prokofieva-Yanchylenko, Yuriy Lutsenko, Andrii Danylyevskiy y Tamara Makarenko*
- 541 **Regulatory activities of the government of Ukraine during marital status conditions**  
Actividades reguladoras del gobierno durante las condiciones de estado civil  
*Anatoliï Zaiets y Zoya Pohoryelova*



- 554 **Formation of military political leadership through the lens of history**  
Formación de liderazgo político militar a través de la lente de la historia  
*Kira Horiacheva, Anatily Yurkov, Andrii Savchenko, Nataliia Snapkova y Dmytro Kilderov*
- 564 **Psicología política de los líderes transformadores en las escuelas del siglo XXI**  
Political psychology of transformational leaders in 21st century schools  
*Oksana Kikinezhti, Yaroslava Vasylkevych, Mykola Ryk, Tamara Hovorun, Liudmyla Bilan y Julia Kharchenko*
- 581 **Administrative coercion as the method for providing state defense order**  
La coerción administrativa como método para proporcionar una orden de defensa del Estado  
*Vladyslav Povydysh, Vitalii Makarchuk, Iryna Nakonechna, Nelli Tsybulnyk y Yevhen Kobko*
- 595 **Government financial support for businesses in the period of global threats**  
Apoyo financiero del gobierno para empresas en el período de amenazas globales  
*Iryna Gryshchenko, Anna Barikova, Volodymyr Oliiynyk, Ivanna Kozak y Nataliia Lutsiv*
- 612 **The role of mass media in the information security public management system**  
El papel de los medios de comunicación en el sistema de gestión pública de la seguridad de la información  
*Svitlana Matviiienkiv, Vasil Klymonchuk, Igor Boychuk, Ihor Dotsiak y Liudmyla Trebyk*
- 628 **Peculiarities of protection of personal non-property intellectual rights on the internet**  
Peculiaridades de la protección de los derechos intelectuales personales no patrimoniales en Internet  
*Ekaterina Spasova, Olha Kulinich, Svitlana Mazurenko, Andrii Ivanytskyi y Olesia Izbash*
- 649 **The essence of administrative legal relations in the sphere of social security for persons with disabilities**  
La esencia de las relaciones jurídicas administrativas en el ámbito de la seguridad social de las personas con discapacidad  
*Kostyantun Fomichov, Nataliia Maksymenko, Oleksandr Yunin, Khrystyna Rezvorovykh y Taisia Shevchenko*
- 662 **Impacto de la invasión rusa a Ucrania en las finanzas mundiales**  
Impact of Russia's invasion of Ukraine on world finance  
*Nataliia Kantsedal, Kseniia Chernenko, Tetiana Dugar, Olha Leha, Liudmyla Yaloveha y Tatiana Priyda*



- 678 **Aproximaciones a la capacidad de autodesarrollo informativo del futuro profesor: Una mirada política del fenómeno**  
Approaches to the informative self-development capacity of the future teacher: A political look at the phenomenon  
*Volodymyr Kozlenko, Rostyslav Liashenko, Vitaly Prysyzhnyi, Nataliia Polishchuk y Kateryna Neborak*
- 698 **Legal aspects of postwar reconstruction and development of the state: Ukrainian experience**  
Aspectos jurídicos de la reconstrucción y el desarrollo del Estado en la posguerra: Experiencia ucraniana  
*Larysa Shevchuk, Andrii Dukhnevych, Nataliia Karpinska, Oksana Starchuk y Nataliia Vozniuk*
- 717 **Legal Aspects of the authoritarian regime in Latin America**  
Aspectos jurídicos del régimen autoritario en América Latina  
*Oleksandr Oleksandrovych Skrypniuk, Oleksandr Vasylovych Skrypniuk, Oksana Vasyliivna Burlak, Nina Oleksandrivna Doroshchuk y Olena Viktorivna Popova*
- 732 **Expropriation and other forms of reparation in terms of compensation for damage caused as a result of war crimes: International legal experience**  
Expropiación y otras formas de reparación en términos de compensación por daños causados como consecuencia de crímenes de guerra: Experiencia jurídica internacional  
*Liydmyla Panova, Ernest Gramatskyi, Dmytro Baranenko, Dmytro Sichko y Oleksiy Uliianov*
- 748 **Public official as a victim of criminal insult and defamation: Comparative Research**  
El funcionario público como víctima de injurias y calumnias: Investigación comparativa  
*Andrii Borovyk, Iryna Tkachenko, Natalia Derevyanko y Yaroslav Diakin*
- 768 **Control simultaneo para la toma de decisiones oportunas en la gestión pública, 2022**  
Simultaneous control for timely decision-making in public management, 2022  
*Jorge Jinchuñá Hualpa, Luis Enrique Fernández Sosa y Ninfa Dalila Carrizales Garabito*
- 791 **Estrategias de atención socioeducativa a la conflictividad multifactorial que atraviesa la escuela. Aportaciones referenciales del Anteproyecto de Ley de Convivencia Escolar Pacífica**  
Strategies for socio-educational attention to the multifactorial conflict that the school is experiencing. Referential contributions of the Draft Law for Peaceful School Coexistence  
*Jesús Morales*



- 808** | **Financial control as a kind of state control over the activities of public railway transport**  
El control financiero como forma de control estatal de las actividades del transporte público ferroviario  
*Hanna Zaikina, Volodymyr Nikitin, Oleksandr Demenko, Oksin Vitaliy y Vadym Bilyk*
- 820** | **Una perspectiva de la patria potestad en América Latina: Especial referencia al caso ecuatoriano**  
A perspective of parental authority in Latin America: special reference to the Ecuadorian case  
*Mayra Roxana Bravo Zambrano*
- 838** | **The role of intellectual property in the post-war development of the health care sector**  
El papel de la propiedad intelectual en el desarrollo del sector sanitario en la posguerra  
*Olha Kronda, Olena Chomakhashvili, Olena Ponomarova, Oksana Kashyntseva y Inha Kryvosheina*
- 854** | **Formation of the ethnic symbolic politics as the mechanism of interaction between society and the political elite: Impact of information technologies**  
Formación de la política simbólica étnica como mecanismo de interacción entre la sociedad y la élite política: impacto de las tecnologías de la información  
*Kylychbek Erkinbekov, Anvar Bugazov, Gulmira Karabalaeva, Alexey Smutko y Amantur Aidaraliev*
- 864** | **Normas para los autores**  
**868** | **Notas sobre arbitraje de artículos**



# Policy issues and legal support for the activity of the State Bureau of Investigation in Ukraine

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.46398/cuestpol.4178.18>

*Olena Gulak* \*  
*Viktoriia Halai* \*\*  
*Pozniakov Spartak* \*\*\*  
*Pavlo Parkhomenko* \*\*\*\*  
*Maryan Hurkovskyy* \*\*\*\*\*

## Abstract

Using dialectics and cognition method the purpose of this work was to analyze the appropriate level of legal support for the activities of the State Bureau of Investigation, to determine its effectiveness and to identify problematic aspects. A number of statutes, reports, online meetings and speeches delivered in the media and in the specialized committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine were investigated. It is concluded that among the shortcomings of the State Bureau of Investigation regulation, the following stand out: 1) Absence of a system of internal law enforcement agencies and clear delimitation of their role; 2) Uncertainty about the status of the State Investigation Bureau as an anti-corruption body; 3) Changes in the status compared to the principal established in the first edition of the Basic Law of Ukraine; 4) Inadequacy of regulatory consolidation of social and pension provision of employees of the State Bank of Ukraine; 5) Questions about the need to create expert services in the SBI system and include them among the state institutions entitled to conduct forensic examinations in Ukraine.

**Keywords:** normative and legal support; law enforcement agencies; State Bureau of Investigation; National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine; wartime crimes against children.

\* National University of Life and Environmental Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv, Ukraine. ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9004-0185>

\*\* State University of Economics and Technology: Kryvyi Rih, Ukraine. ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1568-5068>

\*\*\* Vinnytsia national agrarian university, Vinnytsia, Ukraine. ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3861-3710>

\*\*\*\* Bakhmatsky District Court of Chernihiv Region, Chernihiv, Ukraine. ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0275-9120>

\*\*\*\*\* Lviv State University of Internal Affairs, Lviv, Ukraine. ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4275-8576>

## Cuestiones de política y apoyo jurídico a la actividad de la Oficina Estatal de Investigación en Ucrania

### Resumen

Mediante el uso de la dialéctica y el método de cognición el propósito de este trabajo fue analizar el nivel adecuado de respaldo legal para las actividades de la Oficina Estatal de Investigación, para determinar su eficacia e identificar aspectos problemáticos. Se investigaron una serie de estatutos, informes, reuniones en línea y discursos pronunciados en los medios de comunicación y en el comité especializado de la Rada Suprema de Ucrania. Se concluye que entre las deficiencias de la regulación de la Oficina Estatal de Investigaciones, se destacan las siguientes: 1) Ausencia de un sistema de agencias de aplicación de la ley internas y una delimitación clara de su rol; 2) Incertidumbre sobre la condición del Negociado Estatal de Investigaciones como órgano anticorrupción; 3) Cambios en el estado en comparación con el principal establecido en la primera edición de la Ley Básica de Ucrania; 4) Inadecuación de la consolidación reglamentaria de la provisión social y de pensiones de los empleados del Banco Estatal de Ucrania; 5) Preguntas sobre la necesidad de crear servicios de expertos en el sistema SBI e incluirlos entre las instituciones estatales que tienen derecho a realizar exámenes forenses en Ucrania.

**Palabras clave:** soporte normativo y legal; organismos encargados de hacer cumplir la ley; Oficina Estatal de Investigaciones; Oficina Nacional Anticorrupción de Ucrania; crímenes contra los niños en tiempos de guerra.

### Introduction

The State Bureau of Investigation (after this - SBI) is a Ukrainian state law enforcement agency tasked with the prevention, detection, termination, disclosure, and investigation of criminal offenses primarily against high-ranking officials, heads of anti-corruption agencies, the judicial corps, law enforcement officers and against the established order of wearing military uniform service, which, in fact, concentrates in itself perhaps the most significant powers in terms of the system of currently operating domestic law enforcement agencies as a whole.

At the same time, the legal regime of martial law has a significant impact on the organization of the work of law enforcement agencies that conduct pre-trial investigations. Currently, on the territory of Ukraine, the most resonant, in addition to directly military ones, are crimes against children in the occupied territories, and therefore, the issue of legal responsibility

for sexual and other violence against children committed during wartime is gaining special relevance.

The changes introduced following Laws of Ukraine No. 305-IX dated 03.12.2019 and No. 720-IX dated 17.06.2020 add particular importance and update the status of the body, according to which the SDB from the status of “central body of executive power carrying out law enforcement activities” was transformed into a “state law enforcement body,” which is entrusted with the tasks as mentioned above, which, strengthened the independence of this body and gave it considerable governmental weight (Gulak *et al.*, 2023).

### **1. Objectives**

This work aims to analyze the appropriate level of legal support for the State Bureau of Investigation activities, analyze its effectiveness, and identify problematic aspects.

### **2. Materials and methods**

General scientific and unique scientific methods of cognition were used to achieve the goal, particularly dialectical, formal-logical, analysis, synthesis, systemic-structural, comparative-legal, formal-legal, and prognostic.

The theoretical basis for the research was provided by the scientific output of scientists who dealt with issues of legal support for the system of newly created Ukrainian state law enforcement agencies in general, as well as the legal basis for the formation and operation of the State Bureau of Investigation.

The problems of the functioning and activity of the system of new law enforcement agencies, whose activities are aimed primarily at combating and preventing corruption, were investigated in the work of Gulak O., Kurylo V., Dubchak L., Golovko L., Holovii L., Yara O. (Golovko *et al.*, 2022; Gulak *et al.*, 2015; Gulak *et al.*, 2021; Dubchak *et al.*, 2021; Gulak *et al.*, 2022; Yara *et al.*, 2021). Furthermore, public control over the activities of the State Bureau of Investigation was studied in a recent work by the co-authors of the same scientific publication (Gulak *et al.*, 2023). In the context of writing the article, the work of Ladychenko V., Danyliuk Yu., Golovko L., Kidalov S., Kutsevych M. who studied public participation in ensuring security and law and order at the level of local self-government bodies, was used (Ladychenko *et al.*, 2021; Golovko, 2017; Kidalov *et al.*, 2020; Kutsevych *et al.*, 2020).

A comparative analysis of the legal support of the formation and activity of the newly created state law enforcement bodies of the anti-corruption direction became important in the scope of the research. In addition, several by-laws, reports, online meetings and speeches in the mass media, the specialized committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine were examined, and a critical look was made at the personal participation of the co-authors of the study in the election of the Council of Public Control at the SBI of the new term.

### **3. Results and discussion**

Among several legal conflicts and imperfections in the normative regulation of the legal foundations of the formation and activity of the State Bureau of Investigation, we singled out the following blocks, which we aim to investigate in the course of writing this scientific article:

1. Absence of a system (clearly defined by a single normative legal act of such a list) of domestic law enforcement agencies and a clear delineation of the place of the SBI itself in it;
2. Uncertainty of the status of the State Bureau of Investigation as an anti-corruption body and a body in the system of ensuring domestic national security, in particular, the presence of gaps and conflicting positions in the Basic Law of Ukraine on establishing the foundations of the SBI's activities, as well as in the corresponding profile main legislative acts of Ukraine;
3. Changes in the status of the DBR in comparison with the primary one established in the first edition of the Basic Law of Ukraine, which, by analogy with the status of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine, are such that they contradict the norms of the Constitution of Ukraine and are the subject of consideration in the Constitutional Court of Ukraine;
4. Inadequacy of regulatory consolidation of social and pension provision of employees of the State Bank of Ukraine;
5. Questions regarding the need to create expert services in the SBI system and include them among the state institutions with the right to conduct a forensic examination in Ukraine.

The current legislation of Ukraine needs to contain a clear list of Ukrainian state bodies that are law enforcement. The Law of Ukraine "On State Protection of Court Employees and Law Enforcement Bodies" (Law of Ukraine, 1993) provides an incomplete list of bodies considered law enforcement for this Law. The Law of Ukraine "On the National Security



of Ukraine” (Law of Ukraine, 2018) discloses only the main characteristics of law enforcement agencies. Several subordinate legal acts contain non-exhaustive lists of such bodies. In particular, some founding documents of state bodies directly indicate their law enforcement status (Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, 2009).

So, to the list of law enforcement agencies, which are defined in Article 2, “Basic Concepts” of the Law of Ukraine “On State Protection of Court Employees and Law Enforcement Agencies” following the latest amendments introduced under the norms of Law of Ukraine No. 1150-IX dated 28.01.2021 (Law of Ukraine, 2021a), include the following: “bodies of the prosecutor’s office, the National Police, the security service, the Military Law and Order Service of the Armed Forces of Ukraine, the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine, the state border protection bodies, the Bureau of Economic Security of Ukraine, bodies and institutions for the execution of punishments, pretrial detention centers, bodies of state financial control, fish protection, state of forest protection, other bodies that perform law enforcement or law enforcement functions” (Law of Ukraine, 1993).

At the same time, the content of Article 1 of the Law of Ukraine “On the State Bureau of Investigation” indicates the opposite: “The State Bureau of Investigation is a state law enforcement body entrusted with the tasks of prevention, detection, termination, disclosure, and investigation of criminal offenses assigned to its competence” (Law of Ukraine, 2015).

Therefore, the absence of both a comprehensive normative and legal action regarding the unified definition of the system of “law enforcement agencies” and the absence of the “State Bureau of Investigation” among the list of such, in particular, in Article 2 “Basic Concepts” of the Law of Ukraine “On State Protection of Court Employees and law enforcement agencies” gives rise to many legal differences, collisions, and procedural contradictions.

The same legal conflicts concern the uncertainty of the status of the State Bureau of Investigation as an anti-corruption body and a body in the system of ensuring domestic national security. In particular, the very status of the SBI, enshrined in Article 1 of the Law of Ukraine “On the State Bureau of Investigation” (Law of Ukraine, 2015), mentions the relationship of this body neither to anti-corruption nor that which is part of the Ukrainian security and defense sector does not have.

At the same time, the norms of the Law of Ukraine, “On Prevention of Corruption,” are contradictory, even within the same law. In particular, Article 1, “Definition of Terms” of the Law of Ukraine “On Prevention of Corruption” operates in entirely different interpretations regarding the place and role of the law enforcement body under investigation, defining:

1. among the list of specially authorized entities in the field of anti-corruption - the prosecutor's office, the National Police, the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine, and the National Agency for the Prevention of Corruption;
2. and at the same time, including, following the latest changes stipulated by the provisions of the Law of Ukraine No. 1502-IX dated 01.06.2021 (Law of Ukraine, 2021b), among the regular channels of reporting on possible facts of corruption or corruption-related offenses – methods of protected (including anonymous) reporting of information by the whistleblower to the prosecutor's office, the National Police, the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine, the National Agency for the Prevention of Corruption, and the State Bureau of Investigation (Law of Ukraine, 2014).

Part 2 of Article 12, "Composition of the Security and Defense Sector" of the Law of Ukraine "On National Security of Ukraine" refers to the security and defense sector: "Ministry of Defense of Ukraine, Armed Forces of Ukraine, State Special Transport Service, Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine, National Guard of Ukraine, National Police of Ukraine, State Border Service of Ukraine, State Migration Service of Ukraine, State Emergency Service of Ukraine, Security Service of Ukraine, The Anti-Terrorist Center under the Security Service of Ukraine, the Judicial Security Service, the State Security Office of Ukraine, the State Service for Special Communications and Information Protection of Ukraine, the Apparatus of the National Security and Defense Council of Ukraine, the intelligence agencies of Ukraine, the central body of executive power that ensures the formation and implementation of state military-industrial policy" (Law of Ukraine, 2018), without including the body under study.

Therefore, regardless of the lack of a classification of the State Bureau of Investigation both in the main and in the relevant legislation as an anti-corruption body and a body in the system of ensuring domestic national security, we see the need for such a legal step, since de facto. Accordingly, intermediate norms of the current legislation, the SBI performs these functions directly.

At one time, special anti-corruption laws were adopted (in particular, Laws of Ukraine: "On the Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine" and "On the State Bureau of Investigation"). However, they were not harmonized with the Constitution of Ukraine. This incompleteness of the previous parliament gave rise to many legal conflicts.

Thus, the director of the National Anti-corruption Bureau of Ukraine was appointed in April 2015 by issuing a corresponding Decree of the President of Ukraine, which the Constitution of Ukraine does not provide as the exclusive authority of the highest official of the Ukrainian state.

In December 2019, the Constitutional Court of Ukraine did not agree to the changes to the Constitution of Ukraine, which allowed the President to appoint the directors of the SBI and NABU. On August 28, 2020, the Constitutional Court of Ukraine recognized as unconstitutional the Decree of the President of Ukraine on the appointment of Artem Sytnyk to the position of Director of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau (which took place in April 2015) and the provisions of the Law of Ukraine “On NABU” regarding the participation of the President in the selection and appointment of the Director of the Bureau (Komisarov, 2021).

In order to resolve such significant regulatory discrepancies in the system of anti-corruption legislation, several draft Laws of Ukraine were submitted to the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine. In particular, on February 15, 2021, the Verkhovna Rada registered the government draft law No. 5070 on bringing the status of NABU into compliance with the requirements of the Constitution (Draft Law of Ukraine, 2021a). And on February 22 of the same year - draft Law No. 5133 of February 22, 2021, “On Amendments to Articles 85 and 106 of the Constitution of Ukraine (Regarding the Procedure for Appointment and Dismissal of the Director of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine and the Director of the State Bureau of Investigation)” (Draft Law of Ukraine, 2021b).

The rationale behind the latest legislative initiative was that those anti-corruption law enforcement agencies that investigate and uncover corruption crimes by top officials, judges, and law enforcement officers, namely NABU and SBI, should be as independent as possible from the legislative (Verkhovna Rada) and executive (Cabinet of Ministers) authorities. On March 16, 2021, following the review of the latest legislative initiative, draft Law No. 5133 was sent to the Constitutional Court for its opinion (Draft Law of Ukraine, 2021b).

The proposed constitutional changes are necessary for the legislative recognition of NABU and DBR as state authorities with a special status. From a constitutional and legal point of view, amendments to the Basic Law of our country will make it possible to distinguish the legal status of the State Security Bureau and NABU from the status of other state authorities.

Similar constitutional and legal transformations are due primarily to the specific tasks that the SBI and NABU must carry out within the limits of their powers. At the same time, following the provisions of draft law No. 5133, the improvement of work in the anti-corruption sphere will be based on parity and competitive principles of the procedure for appointing and dismissing directors of these state law enforcement agencies. Similar proposals were repeatedly expressed by Ukraine’s international partners (Shevchuk, 2021).

Note that the current status of NABU in the relevant Law of Ukraine has been changed from a different law enforcement body, whose director is appointed by the President of Ukraine, to a “central body of executive power with a special status,” following the requirements of Law of Ukraine No. 1810-IX dated 19.10.2021 “On Introduction amendments to some laws of Ukraine regarding bringing the status of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine into compliance with the requirements of the Constitution of Ukraine” (Law of Ukraine, 2021c).

Instead, at the same time, the SBI acquires the status of a state law enforcement agency instead of the previous version: “a central body of executive power that carries out law enforcement activities,” following the norms of the Law of Ukraine “On Amendments to Certain Laws of Ukraine on Improving the Activities of the State Bureau of Investigations.” adopted at the end of 2019 (Law of Ukraine, 2019).

In addition, according to the complete order of norms defined for him by the Constitution of Ukraine, the President of Ukraine does not have such powers concerning the newly created body - the State Bureau of Investigation. Therefore, the norm established in Part 2 of Art. 28 of the Law of Ukraine “On the State Bureau of Investigations,” regarding the fact that the Regulations on the Council of Public Control and the procedure for its formation are approved by the President of Ukraine at the request of the Director of the State Bureau of Investigations, do not correspond, in our opinion, to the central Law of our state (Gulak *et al.*, 2023).

Among the essential problematic issues in the activity of the SBI are the following: the issue of social and pension security for SBI employees and the need to create expert services in the SBI system and include them among the state institutions that have the right to conduct forensic examinations in Ukraine.

In particular, a draft of the Law of Ukraine “On Amendments to the Law of Ukraine “On the State Bureau of Investigation” and other legislative acts on social protection of rank-and-file and senior members of the SBI and particular issues of service in the SBI was prepared for the SBI, which, following the procedure established by law, along with accompanying documents, was sent to the Committee of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on Law Enforcement Activities (Letter dated May 11, 2022, No. 10-11-01-6163). However, the subjects of the legislative initiative still need to introduce the specified draft law for consideration by the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine.

In addition, the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, as a subject of the right of a legislative initiative to eliminate legislative gaps and regulate legal relations in the field of pension provision for employees of the State Bureau of Investigation, submitted to the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on

22.07.2021 the draft Law of Ukraine “On making changes to some laws of Ukraine regarding the regulation of certain issues of pension provision and insurance of employees of the State Bureau of Investigation” (reg. No. 5818). According to the results of voting at the plenary session of the VRU, which took place on December 1, 2022, the mentioned draft law was rejected in connection with the issue of pension provision for members of the rank and file of the SBI still needs to be solved.

Currently, the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine is considering draft law No. 5305, “On Amendments to Certain Laws of Ukraine on Improving the Legal Basis of the State Bureau of Investigation,” registered on March 26, 2021.

The Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine adopted the said draft law on 01.07.2021 as a basis. However, during its preparation for the second reading, the norms regarding the creation of expert services in the SBI system and their classification as state institutions entitled to perform forensic examination were removed from it in Ukraine, even though the Opinion of the VRU Committee on Law Enforcement Activities dated November 24, 2021, recommended its adoption in the second reading and as a whole as a law with the necessary technical and legal amendments.

## **Conclusions**

Our analysis of the regulatory and legal foundations of the formation and operation of the State Bureau of Investigation, which, according to its status, is currently, the law enforcement body with the most potent powers, showed several conflicting norms and contradictions.

Among the imperfections of the normative regulation of the legal foundations of the formation and activity of the State Bureau of Investigation, we singled out the following blocks, which were investigated in the course of writing this scientific article:

1. Absence of a system (clearly defined by a single normative legal act of such a list) of domestic law enforcement agencies and a clear delineation of the place of the SBI itself in it;
2. Uncertainty of the status of the State Bureau of Investigation as an anti-corruption body and a body in the system of ensuring domestic national security, in particular, the presence of gaps and conflicting positions in the Basic Law of Ukraine on establishing the foundations of the SBI’s activities, as well as in the corresponding profile main legislative acts of Ukraine;
3. Changes in the status of the DBR in comparison with the primary one established in the first edition of the Basic Law of Ukraine,

which, by analogy with the status of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine, are such that they contradict the norms of the Constitution of Ukraine and are the subject of consideration in the Constitutional Court of Ukraine;

4. Inadequacy of regulatory consolidation of social and pension provision of employees of the State Bank of Ukraine;
5. Questions regarding the need to create expert services in the SBI system and include them among the state institutions with the right to conduct a forensic examination in Ukraine.

It was concluded that the absence of both a comprehensive legal act regarding the unified definition of the system of “law enforcement agencies” and the absence of the “State Bureau of Investigation” among the list of such, in particular, in Article 2 “Basic Concepts” of the Law of Ukraine “On State Protection of Court Employees and law enforcement agencies” gives rise to many legal differences, collisions, and procedural contradictions.

In addition, regardless of the lack of a classification of the State Bureau of Investigation as an anti-corruption body and a body in the system of ensuring domestic national security in both the primary and specialized legislation, we see the need for such a legal step, since de facto. Accordingly, intermediate norms of current legislation, the SBI performs these functions directly.

### **Bibliographic References**

- DRAFT LAW OF UKRAINE. 2021a. On making changes to some laws of Ukraine regarding bringing the status of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine into compliance with the requirements of the Constitution of Ukraine: Draft Law of Ukraine № 5070. Available Online. In: [https://w1.c1.rada.gov.ua/pls/zweb2/webproc4\\_1?pf3511=71099](https://w1.c1.rada.gov.ua/pls/zweb2/webproc4_1?pf3511=71099). Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- DRAFT LAW OF UKRAINE. 2021b. On Amendments to Articles 85 and 106 of the Constitution of Ukraine (Regarding the Procedure for Appointment and Dismissal of the Director of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine and the Director of the State Bureau of Investigation): Draft Law of Ukraine № 5133. Available Online. In: [http://w1.c1.rada.gov.ua/pls/zweb2/webproc4\\_1?pf3511=71205](http://w1.c1.rada.gov.ua/pls/zweb2/webproc4_1?pf3511=71205). Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- DUBCHAK, Ludmila; GULAK, Olena. 2021. “Creation of the State Bureau of Investigation as a state law enforcement body of the Ukrainian government and the problem of its professionalization” In: Public management and administration in Ukraine. No. 23. pp. 80-85.

- GOLOVKO, Liudmyla. 2017. Implementation of EU Water Policy in Ukraine: Problems and Perspectives. Proceedings of the 8<sup>th</sup> International Scientific Conference Rural Development, pp. 605-610.
- GOLOVKO, Liudmyla; LADYCHENKO, Viktor; KUDIN, Andrew; YARA, Olena; ULIUTINA, Olena. 2022. "Exercising the Right to a Fair Trial during the Covid-19 Pandemic in Ukraine and the European Union" In: Cuestiones Politicas. Vol. 40, No. 75, pp. 89-103.
- GULAK Olena; KURYLO, Volodymyr; DUBCHAK, Ludmila. 2021. "To the question of ways to overcome corruption in Ukraine" In: Law and public administration. No. 1, pp. 196-201.
- GULAK, Olena; GOLOVKO, Liudmyla; HOLOVIY, Lyudmyla. 2022. "Legal responsibility for corruption and related offenses in the field of land relations" In: Law. Human. Environment. Vol. 13, No. 01, pp. 73-80.
- GULAK, Olena; HOLOVIY, Lyudmyla. 2015. "Reforming the system of internal affairs bodies of Ukraine: present and prospects" In: International Scientific Journal. No. 5, pp. 67-71.
- GULAK, Olena; HALAI, Andrii; IARMOLENKO, Iuliia; SPODYNSKYI, Oleksandr; KAPITANENKO, Nataliia. 2023. "Public control over the activities of the State Bureau of Investigation: A comparative analysis" In: Cuestiones Políticas. Vol. 41, No. 77, pp. 584-595.
- KIDALOV, Serhii; VITIV, Vitaliy; GOLOVKO, Liudmyla; LADYCHENKO, Viktor. 2020. "Legal Regulation of Waste Management in Ukraine on the Way to European Integration" In: European Journal of Sustainable Development. Vol. 9, No. 2, pp. 422-430.
- KOMISAROV, Oleksandr. 2021. The Council finally changed the status of NABU and the procedure for appointing the Director of the Bureau. 10/19/2021. Available Online. In: <https://suspilne.media/173062-rada-ostatocno-zminila-status-nabu-ta-poradok-priznacenna-direktora-buro/>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- KUTSEVYCH, Maksym; YARA, Olena; GOLOVKO, Liudmyla; TERPELIUK, Volodymyr. 2020. "Sustainable Approaches to Waste Management: Regulatory and Financial Instruments" In: European Journal of Sustainable Development. Vol. 09, No. 02, pp. 163-171.
- LADYCHENKO, Viktor; GULAK, Olena; DANYLIUK, Yuri. 2021. "Ensuring security and law and order by local self-government bodies: current state and ways of settlement" In: Scientific Papers of the Legislation Institute of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine. No. 04, pp. 31-39.



- LAW OF UKRAINE. 1993. On state protection of court employees and law enforcement agencies: Law of Ukraine dated 23.12.1993 № 3781-XII. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/3781-12#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2014. On prevention of corruption: Law of Ukraine № 1700-VII. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1700-18#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2015. About the State Bureau of Investigation: Law of Ukraine № 794-VIII. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/794-19#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2018. On the national security of Ukraine: Law of Ukraine dated 21.06.2018 № 2469. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2469-19#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2019. On amendments to some laws of Ukraine regarding the improvement of the activities of the State Bureau of Investigation: Law of Ukraine № 305-IX. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/305-20#n7>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2021a. About the Bureau of Economic Security of Ukraine: Law of Ukraine № 1150-IX. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1150-20#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2021b. On amendments to the Law of Ukraine “On Prevention of Corruption” regarding regulation of certain issues of protection of whistleblowers: Law of Ukraine № 1502-IX. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1502-20#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- LAW OF UKRAINE. 2021c. On amending some laws of Ukraine to bring the status of the National Anti-Corruption Bureau of Ukraine into compliance with the requirements of the Constitution of Ukraine: Law of Ukraine № 1810-IX. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1810-20#n55>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- RESOLUTION OF THE CABINET OF MINISTERS OF UKRAINE. 2009. On the approval of the Regulation on state forest protection: Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine № 976. Available Online. In: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/976-2009-%Do%BF#Text>. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.
- SHEVCHUK, Yuliana. 2021. Constitutional changes: to improve NABU and SBI or remove Sytnyk? 02/24/2021. Multimedia platform of foreign language of Ukraine. Available Online. In: <https://www.ukrinform.ua/>



rubric-politics/3196318-konstitucijni-zmini-vdoskonaliti-nabu-i-dbr-ci-sitnika-znati.html. Consultation date: 02/03/2023.

YARA, Olena; BRAZHEYEV, Anatoliy; GOLOVKO, Liudmyla; BASHKATOVA, Viktoriia. 2021. "Legal Regulation of the Use of Artificial Intelligence: Problems and Development Prospects" In: European Journal of Sustainable Development. Vol. 10, No. 1, pp. 281-289.